Chest physiotherapy compared to no chest physiotherapy for cystic fibrosis (Review)

van der Schans C, Prasad A, Main E



This is a reprint of a Cochrane review, prepared and maintained by The Cochrane Collaboration and published in *The Cochrane Library* 2007, Issue 2

http://www.thecochranelibrary.com



TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	1
PLAIN LANGUAGE SUMMARY	1
BACKGROUND	2
OBJECTIVES	2
CRITERIA FOR CONSIDERING STUDIES FOR THIS REVIEW	2
SEARCH METHODS FOR IDENTIFICATION OF STUDIES	3
METHODS OF THE REVIEW	4
DESCRIPTION OF STUDIES	4
METHODOLOGICAL QUALITY	4
RESULTS	4
DISCUSSION	5
AUTHORS' CONCLUSIONS	6
NOTES	6
POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST	6
SOURCES OF SUPPORT	6
REFERENCES	7
	15
Characteristics of included studies	15
Characteristics of excluded studies	17
GRAPHS AND OTHER TABLES	20
INDEX TERMS	20
COVER SHEET	20

Chest physiotherapy compared to no chest physiotherapy for cystic fibrosis (Review)

van der Schans C, Prasad A, Main E

This record should be cited as:

van der Schans C, Prasad A, Main E. Chest physiotherapy compared to no chest physiotherapy for cystic fibrosis. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews* 2000, Issue 2. Art. No.: CD001401. DOI: 10.1002/14651858.CD001401.

This version first published online: 24 April 2000 in Issue 2, 2000. Date of most recent substantive amendment: 09 February 2000

ABSTRACT

Background

Chest physiotherapy is widely used in people with cystic fibrosis in order to clear mucus from the airways.

Objectives

To determine the effectiveness and acceptability of chest physiotherapy compared to no treatment or spontaneous cough alone to improve mucus clearance in cystic fibrosis.

Search strategy

We searched the Cochrane Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group Trials Register which comprises references identified from comprehensive electronic database searches and handsearches of relevant journals and abstract books of conference proceedings.

Date of the most recent search of the Group's Cystic Fibrosis Trials Register: September 2006.

Selection criteria

Randomised or quasi-randomised clinical trials in which a form of chest physiotherapy (airway clearance technique) were taken for consideration in people with cystic fibrosis compared with either no physiotherapy treatment or spontaneous cough alone.

Data collection and analysis

Both authors independently assessed trial eligibility, extracted data and assessed trial quality.

Main results

One hundred and twenty-six trials were identified by the search, of which six cross-over trials with 66 participants were found eligible for inclusion in the review. Five studies were single treatment studies; in one study each treatment regimen was used twice daily for two consecutive days. Three studies, involving 36 participants, found a higher amount of expectorated secretions during chest physiotherapy as compared to a control period. Two studies, involving 24 participants found no significant effect on pulmonary function variables following intervention. In four studies radioactive tracer clearance was used as an outcome variable. In three of these, involving 28 participants, it was found that chest physiotherapy, including coughing, increased radioactive tracer clearance as compared to the control period. One study of eight participants, reported no significant difference between chest physiotherapy, without coughing, compared to the control period.

Authors' conclusions

The results of this review show that airway clearance techniques have short-term effects in the terms of increasing mucus transport. No evidence was found on which to draw conclusions concerning the long-term effects.

PLAIN LANGUAGE SUMMARY

There is some evidence to support short-term but not long-term beneficial effects of chest physiotherapy in people with cystic fibrosis

Excess production of mucus leads to recurrent infection and tissue damage in lungs of people with cystic fibrosis. It is important to clear secretions using medications and chest physiotherapy (CPT). Physiotherapy clears secretions by various drainage and breathing techniques or mechanical devices or both. Daily physiotherapy is time-consuming and burdensome. Airway clearance techniques have short-term beneficial effects on mucus transport. Four studies measuring radioactive tracer clearance, found increased clearance with CPT; three studies measuring expectorated sputum, found a higher amount with CPT. There is currently no clear evidence of long-term effects in chest clearance, quality of life or survival.

BACKGROUND

Cystic fibrosis (CF) is a common inherited life-limiting disorder. Persistent infection and inflammation within the lungs are the major contributory factors to severe airway damage and loss of respiratory function over the years (Cantin 1995; Konstan 1997). Excessive production of thick mucus may overwhelm the normal mucus transport mechanisms and thereby lead to airway obstruction and mucus plugging (Zach 1990). Removal of airway secretions is therefore an integral part of the management of CF. A variety of methods are used to help remove secretions from the lungs, some physical, i.e. chest physiotherapy, and some chemical, i.e. medications and inhalation therapies. Treatment methods which improve mucus clearance are considered essential in optimising respiratory status and reducing the progression of lung disease.

Chest physiotherapy has, for a long time, played an important role in assisting the clearance of airway secretions and is usually commenced as soon as the diagnosis of CF is made. However, the performance of chest physiotherapy may be unpleasant, uncomfortable, and time-consuming. Early chest physiotherapy relied on techniques for which the assistance of another person, such as a physiotherapist or relative, was needed and which included postural drainage, percussion, vibration, and shaking performed by an assistant and huffing or coughing. More recently, several self-administered alternatives to these conventional techniques have been developed. These include the active cycle of breathing techniques (ACBT), forced expiration technique (FET), autogenic drainage (AD), positive expiratory pressure (PEP), flutter, high frequency chest compression (HFCC) and exercise. We have defined all of these methods under the interventions below. These methods of treatment help to give the individual with CF more independence in their management. Despite the expansion of treatment modalities, there remains little evidence supporting their efficacy (Prasad 1998; van der Schans 1996). A previous meta-analysis (Thomas 1995a) concluded that standard chest physiotherapy resulted in more mucus (phlegm or sputum) expectoration than no treatment in people with CF, however a recent Cochrane review reported that there is not enough evidence to support or refute mucus clearance techniques for people with COPD or bronchiectasis (Jones 1998). This review compares the efficacy of any of these interventions as compared to no treatment or spontaneous coughing alone. Subsequent reviews will aim to determine whether a specific type of treatment offers any advantage over others.

OBJECTIVES

To determine the effectiveness of chest physiotherapy (airway clearance) compared to no treatment or cough alone in people with CF. This review does not address all possible comparisons between the multiple treatment techniques available for people with CF. This review is the first in a series of reviews which will compare the efficacy of different treatment modalities.

The following hypotheses will be tested: chest physiotherapy, whatever the type of intervention, is more:

- (1) effective than no chest physiotherapy;
- (2) effective than spontaneous coughing alone;
- (3) acceptable than no chest physiotherapy;
- (4) acceptable than spontaneous coughing alone.

CRITERIA FOR CONSIDERING STUDIES FOR THIS REVIEW

Types of studies

Randomised or quasi-randomised clinical trials.

Short-term studies (less than seven days duration, including single treatment studies) will be analysed separately from studies of longer duration.

Types of participants

People with CF, of any age, diagnosed on the basis of clinical criteria and sweat testing or genotype analysis.

Types of intervention

Chest physiotherapy of any type (see below) compared to no chest physiotherapy or spontaneous coughing alone.

In existing literature and in practical terms, variation occurs in the application of specific techniques. For the purposes of this series of reviews, it is necessary to group these variations under their broader headings. Separate analysis of each variation would render the reviews unmanageable. The following interventions aim to improve mucus transport or facilitate expectoration:

Conventional chest physiotherapy

This will include any combination of the following: postural drainage; percussion; chest shaking; huffing; and directed cough-

ing. It should not include the use of exercise, PEP or other mechanical devices.

Positive expiratory pressure (PEP) mask therapy

As described by the authors to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques. PEP is defined as breathing with a positive expiratory pressure of 10 to 25 cm H_2O .

High pressure PEP (hPEP) mask therapy

As described by the authors to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques. It is a modification of the above PEP technique but includes a full forced expiration against a fixed mechanical resistance.

Active cycle of breathing techniques (ACBT)

This includes relaxation or breathing control, forced expiration technique (FET), thoracic expansion exercises and may include postural drainage or chest clapping.

Autogenic Drainage (AD)

As described originally by Chevalier or modified versions thereof. The authors should have identified AD to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques.

Exercise

With the sole purpose of improving mucus clearance as the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques.

Oscillating devices

Oscillating devices including flutter or cornet, thoracic oscillation, and oral oscillation. Flutter or cornet as described by the authors to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques. These devices produce an oscillatory PEP effect. Thoracic oscillation as defined by the authors to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques, to provide oscillation to the chest wall. Oral oscillation as defined by the authors to be the primary intervention, with or without additional techniques, to provide oscillation to the airways via the mouth.

Two authors independently categorised the physiotherapeutic interventions.

Types of outcome measures

(1) Expectorated secretions (mucus, sputum, phlegm), dry or wet weight, or volume

An increase in the amount of expectorated secretions as a shortterm effect of the intervention is considered as beneficial.

(2) Pulmonary function tests

Forced expiratory volume in one second (FEV₁), forced vital capacity (FVC), forced expiratory flow between 25% and 75% expired FVC (FEF₂₅₋₇₅) post-intervention objective change from baseline compared to control

- $(3) \, {\rm Oxygen} \, {\rm saturation} \, {\rm measured} \, {\rm by} \, {\rm pulse} \, {\rm or} \, {\rm transcutaneous} \, {\rm oximetry}$
- (4) Total lung capacity (TLC) and functional residual capacity (FRC)

Objective change from baseline compared to control

- (5) Mucus transport rate Assessed by radioactive tracer clearance
- (6) Radiological ventilation scanning
- (7) Subjective perception of well-being, ability to participate in activities of daily living
- (8) Therapy compliance
- (9) Objective change in exercise tolerance;
- (10) Nutritional status Assessed by growth, weight, body composition
- (11) Number of respiratory exacerbations per year
- (12) Number of days in hospital per year
- (13) Number of days of intravenous antibiotics per year
- (14) Cost of intervention Equipment and duration
- (15) Deaths

Outcome data from longer-term studies (more than seven days) will be grouped into those measured at one, three, six, twelve months and annually thereafter. If outcome data is recorded at other time periods, then consideration will be given to examining these as well. Short-term studies are defined as studies with a duration less than seven days.

SEARCH METHODS FOR IDENTIFICATION OF STUDIES

See: Cochrane Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group methods used in reviews.

Relevant studies were identified from the Group's Cystic Fibrosis Trials Register using the terms: physiotherapy AND conventional.

The Cystic Fibrosis Trials Register is compiled from electronic searches of the Cochrane Central Register of Controlled Trials (CENTRAL) (updated each new issue of *The Cochrane Library*), quarterly searches of MEDLINE, a search of EMBASE to 1995 and the prospective handsearching of two journals - *Pediatric Pulmonology* and the *Journal of Cystic Fibrosis*. Unpublished work is identified by searching the abstract books of three major cystic fibrosis conferences: the International Cystic Fibrosis Conference and the North American Cystic Fibrosis Conference. For full details of all searching activities for the register, please see the relevant sections of the Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group Module.

Date of the most recent search of the Group's Trials Register: September 2006.

METHODS OF THE REVIEW

We reviewed the studies according to the protocol outlined below.

- (1) Two authors from different centres independently assessed which trials should be included.
- (2) Two authors independently assessed the quality of the included studies using a system as described by Jadad (Jadad 1996). In the event of disagreement about inclusion of a trial, or the quality score, we asked an independent author from a third centre to review the paper(s) in question.
- (3) Each author independently extracted data on the outcome measures listed above.
- (4) Reviewers used the Cochrane Review Manager software to compile and analyse the data (Review Manager 2004).

For continuous outcomes, we recorded either the mean change from baseline for each group or mean post-treatment or intervention values and the standard deviation or standard error for each group. In the case of binary outcomes, in order to allow an intention-to-treat analysis, we collected data on the number of participants with each outcome event by allocated treated group irrespective of compliance and whether or not the participant was later thought to be ineligible or otherwise excluded for treatment or follow up.

If trials had a cross-over design, the analysis that we planned to carry out is one recommended by Elbourne, however this was not possible with the data currently available (Elbourne 2002).

DESCRIPTION OF STUDIES

Summary details are given in the 'Characteristics of included studies' section.

Of the 126 studies of airway clearance techniques identified by the literature search, 106 were excluded as they lacked a 'no treatment' or 'spontaneous coughing' control group. Of the 20 remaining studies, two were not clinical trials; four included diagnoses other than cystic fibrosis; five did not evaluate chest physiotherapy; one because none of the outcome measures which we had defined for this review were used; one because the intervention was not thought to improve mucus clearance; and one was in participants during an intra-operative period under anaesthesia. The remaining six studies were included. These were cross-over in design and included a control period.

Mortensen compared two treatments, postural drainage combined with the FET; and PEP breathing combined with the FET with a control period (spontaneous coughing) in a three-day cross-over trial. This was described in one abstract as having 10 participants and in another abstract as having 11 participants (Mortensen 1991). In this short-term study each treatment was given only once on one of three separate days. Falk compared the same treatments and the same study design in 12 people with CF (Falk 1993).

Pfleger compared four forms of chest physiotherapy (PEP breathing, AD, PEP breathing followed by AD or AD followed by PEP breathing) with a control period (including some directed coughing) in 14 people with CF (Pfleger 1992). In this short-term study each treatment was undertaken once on separate days.

Rossman compared the immediate effect of four forms of chest physiotherapy (directed vigorous cough, postural drainage, postural drainage with mechanical percussion and conventional physiotherapy) with a control (including some requested cough periods) in six people with CF in a cross-over design (Rossman 1982). In this short-term study each treatment was given only once on separate days.

Van der Schans compared the immediate effect of two forms of chest physiotherapy (positive expiratory pressure breathing with 5 cm water pressure followed by directed vigorous coughing or PEP breathing with 15 cm water pressure followed by directed vigorous coughing) with a control period in eight CF participants in a cross-over design (van der Schans 1991). In this short-term study each treatment was given only once on separate days.

Braggion compared the immediate effect of three forms of chest physiotherapy (HFCC combined with FET and coughing, PEP combined with FET and coughing or postural drainage combined with vibrations, deep breathing, percussion or FET and coughing) with a control (spontaneous coughing) (Braggion 1995). Each regimen was used twice a day for two consecutive days.

METHODOLOGICAL QUALITY

The methodological quality scored using the Jadad score is as follows: Mortensen: 1 (Mortensen 1991); Falk: 1 (Falk 1993); Pfleger: 2 (Pfleger 1992); Rossman: 1 (Rossman 1982); van der Schans: 1 (van der Schans 1991); Braggion: 2 (Braggion 1995). The maximal score according to Jadad is five, however, two items are related to blinding of the investigator. Since blinding of the investigator is impossible in case of chest physiotherapy the maximal possible score for these studies is only three.

RESULTS

Six trials were included. All are cross-over trials and no meta-analysis was possible. All were short-term studies (less then seven days). Five studies were single treatment studies (Falk 1993; Mortensen 1991; Pfleger 1992; Rossman 1982; van der Schans 1991) and in one study each physiotherapy treatment was given four times (Braggion 1995).

(1) Expectorated secretions

Three studies, involving 36 participants, found a higher amount of expectorated secretions during chest physiotherapy compared to the control period (Braggion 1995; Pfleger 1992; Rossman 1982).

In the study by Pfleger, the mean weight of expectorated mucus during spontaneous coughing was approximately 17 g and during the three forms of chest physiotherapy between 34 to 45 g (Pfleger 1992). Braggion found a mean wet weight of expectorated secretions during the control day of 6 g and during the chest physiotherapy sessions 23 to 30 g (Braggion 1995). Rossman found a statistically significant higher volume of expectorated secretions during the different forms of chest physiotherapy compared to the control session (Rossman 1982).

(2) Pulmonary function tests

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(3) Oxygen saturation measured by pulse or transcutaneous oximetry

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(4) Total lung capacity (TLC) and functional residual capacity (FRC)

Two studies, involving 24 participants, measured TLC and FRC after chest physiotherapy and found no significant effect on pulmonary function variables following intervention (Braggion 1995; van der Schans 1991).

(5) Mucus transport rate as assessed by radioactive tracer clearance

In four studies radioactive tracer clearance was used as an outcome variable (Falk 1993; Mortensen 1991; Rossman 1982; van der Schans 1991). In three of these, involving 28 participants, it was found that chest physiotherapy, including coughing, increased radioactive tracer clearance as compared to the control period (Falk 1993; Mortensen 1991; Rossman 1982). In the study by Mortensen, median clearance after 30 minutes during control was 7% and during two different chest physiotherapy sessions was 33% and 34% (Mortensen 1991). Falk found approximately 6% clearance during the control measurement and 9% during chest physiotherapy (Falk 1993). Rossman found 32% radioactive tracer clearance during the control measurement and 40 to 46% during the different forms of chest physiotherapy (Rossman 1982). One study, of eight participants, reported no significant difference between two different chest physiotherapy sessions of PEPbreathing (clearance 10% and 6%), without coughing, compared to a control period (clearance 8%) (van der Schans 1991). Different outcomes between the study by van der Schans and the other studies can be explained by the fact that in the van der Schans study participants were requested not to cough, but coughing was encouraged in the other studies as a part of the treatment (van der Schans 1991).

(6) Radiological ventilation scanning

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(7) Subjective perception of well-being, ability to participate in activities of daily living

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(8) Therapy compliance

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(9) Objective change in exercise tolerance

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(10) Nutritional status as assessed by growth, weight, body composition

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(11) Number of respiratory exacerbations per year

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(12) Number of days in hospital per year

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(13) Number of days of intravenous antibiotics per year

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(14) Cost of intervention (equipment and duration)

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

(15) Deaths

No data were available in any of the studies regarding this outcome.

DISCUSSION

Chest physiotherapy has been a mainstay of the respiratory management of people with CF for so long that it may now be difficult for these people, their parents, physiotherapists and medical staff to consider a trial design that incorporated a no treatment control group for any length of time. Despite there being a reasonable degree of equipoise with regard to whether physiotherapy is better than no treatment, many would argue that to recruit participants into a no treatment group would be unethical. This explains in part why there are currently no long-term trials which use this design.

Evidence from short-term or single treatment studies, which incorporate a 'no treatment' group, should be interpreted with caution because of the long-term nature of the disease. The clinical consequences of missing one or two treatments is unlikely to be significant. Despite this limitation, the majority of physiotherapy studies involve single treatment or short-term study designs. In addition, the small participant numbers and enormous heterogeneity of treatments and outcome measures reported in the literature make it impossible to pool results from different studies. The short-term studies that were included in this review suggest that chest physiotherapy increases mucus transport in people with CF. This finding supports the conclusion of an earlier review (Thomas 1995a).

Finally a sham or placebo treatment clearly cannot be substituted for a clearly physical intervention such as percussion, PEP or postural drainage. Similarly, participants and therapists cannot be 'blinded' from the treatment being received. This partly explains the low quality scores of the included studies, as the Jadad scoring system places significant emphasis on blinding. Methodological variations between systematic reviews/meta-analyses may account for the differences in conclusions regarding treatment efficacy. The included cross-over trials may have provided potentially useful information about the efficacy of physiotherapy treatments.

AUTHORS' CONCLUSIONS

Implications for practice

Short-term cross-over trials suggest that airway clearance regimens have beneficial effects in people with CF in regard to improving mucus transport. However, based on this review, we have not been able to find any robust scientific evidence to support the hypothesis that chest physiotherapy for the purpose of clearing airway secretions has a long-term beneficial effect in people with CF, nor to support the claim by some authors that it is harmful.

Implications for research

The gold standard for establishing efficacy of therapy is the randomised controlled trial with a 'no treatment' group. The application of this study design to the question in this review would be very effective. However, several ethical considerations could be raised in the discussion with regard to the withdrawal of an established and trusted treatment like chest physiotherapy in people with CF, even in the absence of firm evidence. On the other hand, it could be argued that in view of scant evidence to support the use of chest physiotherapy for people with CF and the fact that this intervention can be unpleasant, uncomfortable, and time-consuming, we believe that a study with a control group with no treatment in some circumstances is justified. Therefore, we propose that in future research, control groups or control periods should be included with sufficient numbers of included participants. This would be best studied as a parallel study over a time period of months rather than days or weeks.

NOTES

Information on previous updates

Review update: November 2005

The search of the Group's Cystic Fibrosis Trials Register identified four new references. One study identified was not eligible for inclusion in the review and has been added to the 'Excluded studies' section (Chatham 2004). The remaining three references were to three already excluded studies (Darbee 1990; Marks 1999; McIlwaine 1997).

Review update: May 2004

Additional references (providing no additional information) have been added to the following already 'Included studies': Mortensen 1991; Falk 1993.

Additional references have been added to the following already 'Excluded studies': Button 1997a: Costantini 1998: Orlik 2001.

Three new studies have been added to 'Excluded studies': Hare 2002; Orlik 2000; Tannenbaum 2001.

Review update: August 2002

Six crossover trials, previously cited in "Excluded Studies" have now been moved to the "Included Studies" section (Braggion 1995; Falk 1993; Mortensen 1991; Pfleger 1992; Rossman 1982; van der Schans 1991). Relevant changes to the text of the review have been made.

Four new "Excluded Studies" have been incorporated into the review (Battistini 2001; Keller 2001; Pollard 2000; Orlick 2001).

Additional references to studies already listed in "Excluded Studies" have been incorporated into the review within the following study ID's: Button 1997a; Gondor 1999; Grasso 2000; Marks 1999; Newhouse 1998).

POTENTIAL CONFLICT OF INTEREST

None known.

SOURCES OF SUPPORT

External sources of support

• No sources of support supplied

Internal sources of support

• No sources of support supplied

REFERENCES

References to studies included in this review

Braggion 1995 {published data only}

* Braggion C, Cappelletti LM, Cornacchia M, Zanolla L, Mastella G. Short-term effects of three chest physiotherapy regimens in patients hospitalized for pulmonary exacerbations of cystic fibrosis: a crossover randomized study. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**19**(1):16–22.

Cappelletti LM, Cornacchia M, Braggion C, Zanolla L, Mastella G. Short-term effects of 3 physiotherapy (CPT) regimens in cystic fibrosis (CF) patients hospitalized for a pulmonary exacerbation: a crossover randomized trial [abstract]. Proceedings of the 18th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1993; Madrid. 1993:W9.3.

Falk 1993 {published data only}

Falk M, Mortensen J, Kelstrup M, Lanng S, Larsen L, Ulrik CS. Short-term effects of positive expiratory pressure and the forced expiration technique on mucus clearance and lung function in CF [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1993;**Suppl** 9:241.

Larsen L, Mortensen J, Falk M, Kelstrup M, Lanng S, Ulrik CS. Radiolabelled mucus clearance in patients with cystic fibrosis is improved by physiotherapy with positive expiratory pressure and the forced expiration techniques [abstract]. Clinical Physiology. 1994; Vol. 14:365.

Mortensen J, Falk M, Kelstrup M, Lanng S, Ulrik CS. Effect of positive expiratory pressure and the forced expiration technique on mucus clearance in patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *European Respiratory Journal* 1993;6(Suppl 17):490s.

Mortensen 1991 {published data only}

Falk M, Mortensen J, Jensen C, Groth S, Jensen T. Postural drainage or PEP effects on tracheobronchial clearance in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990;**Suppl** 5:226.

* Mortensen J, Falk M, Groth S, Jensen C. The effects of postural drainage and positive expiratory pressure physiotherapy on tracheobronchial clearance in cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1991;**100**(5):1350–7.

Mortensen J, Groth S, Falk M, Jensen C, Jensen T. Assessment of tracheobronchial clearance by sputum exporectorated during chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *European Respiratory Journal* 1991;3(Suppl 10):260s–61s.

Pfleger 1992 {published data only}

* Pfleger A, Theißl B, Oberwaldner B, Zach MS. Self-administered chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis: a comparative study of high-pressure PEP and autogenic drainage. *Lung* 1992;**170**(6):323–30.

Theißl B, Pfleger A, Oberwaldner B, Zach M. Chest physiotherapy (PT) in Cystic Fibrosis (CF) - a comparative study of high-pressure PEP and autogenic drainage [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990; **Suppl 5**:256.

Rossman 1982 {published data only}

Rossman C, Waldes R, Sampson D, Newhouse M. Does chest physiotherapy improve mucus removal in patients with cystic fibrosis? [abstract]. Proceedings of the Eighth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1980. 1980:32a.

* Rossman CM, Waldes R, Sampson D, Newhouse MT. Effect of chest physiotherapy on the removal of mucus in patients with cystic fibrosis. *American Review of Respiratory Disease* 1982;**126**(1):131–5.

van der Schans 1991 {published data only}

van der Schans CP, van der Mark TW, de Vries G, Piers DA, Beekhuis H, Dankert-Roelse JE, et al. Effect of positive expiratory pressure breathing in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 1991;**46**(4):252–6.

References to studies excluded from this review

App 1998

App EM, Danzl G, Schweiger K, Kieselmann R, Reinhardt D, Lindemann H, et al. Sputum rheology changes in cystic fibrosis lung disease following two different types of physiotherapy - VRP1 (flutter) versus autogenic drainage [abstract]. Proceedings of the American Thoracic Society (American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine Supplements); 1995. 1995; Vol. 151:A737.

* App EM, Kieselmann R, Reinhardt D, Lindemann H, Dasgupta B, King M, et al. Sputum rheology changes in cystic fibrosis lung disease following two different types of physiotherapy: flutter vs autogenic drainage. *Chest* 1998;**114**(1):171–7.

Arens 1994

* Arens R, Gozal D, Omlin KJ, Vega J, Boyd KP, Keens TG, et al. Comparison of high frequency chest compression and conventional chest physiotherapy in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine* 1994; **150**(4):1154–7.

Arens R, Gozal D, Omlin KJ, Vega J, Boyd KP, Woo MS, et al. Comparative efficacy of high frequency chest compression and conventional chest physiotherapy in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pedaitric Pulmonology* 1993;**Suppl** 9:239.

Bain 1988

Bain J, Bishop J, Olinsky A. Evaluation of directed coughing in cystic fibrosis. *British Journal of Diseases of the Chest* 1988;**82**(2):138–48.

Baldwin 1994

Baldwin DR, Hill AL, Peckham DG, Knox AJ. Effect of addition of exercise to chest physiotherapy on sputum expectoration and lung function in adults with cystic fibrosis. *Respiratory Medicine* 1994;**88** (1):49–53.

Baran 1977

Baran D, Penalosa A, Degre S. Physical working capacity before and after chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis. *Cystic Fibrosis* 1977:239–44.

Battistini 2001

Battistine R, Balestri E, Ambroni M, Miano A. Efficacy of underwater positive expiratory pressure therapy (UPEP) for mucus clearance in patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstracts of the 24th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 2001 June 6-9; Vienna. 2001:104.

Bauer 1994

Bauer M, Schoumacher R. Comparison of efficacy of manual and mechanical percussion in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990; **Suppl** 5:249.

* Bauer ML, McDougal J, Schoumacher RA. Comparison of manual and mechanical chest percussion in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis. *Journal of Pediatrics* 1994;**124**(2):250–4.

Bilton 1992

Bilton D, Dodd M, Webb AK. The benefits of exercise combined with physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990;**Suppl 5**:238.

* Bilton D, Dodd ME, Abbot JV, Webb AK. The benefits of exercise combined with physiotherapy in the treatment of adults with cystic fibrosis. *Respiratory Medicine* 1992;86(6):507–11.

Blomquist 1986

Blomquist M, Freyschuss U, Wiman L.G, Strandvik B. Physical activity and self treatment in cystic fibrosis. *Archives of Disease in Childhood* 1989;**61**(4):361–7.

Braggion 1996

Braggion C, Pradal U, Mastella G, Coates AL, Milic Emili J. Effect of different inspiratory maneuvers on FEV1 in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1996;**110**(3):642–7.

Button 1997a

Button BM, Catto-Smith AG, Olinsky A, Phelan PD, Story I. Newborn screening in cystic fibrosis: the physiotherapist's dilemma in safe and effective treatment - to tip or not to tip? [abstract]. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine* 1998;**157**(Suppl 3): A130.

Button BM, Heine R, Catto-Smith A, Olinsky A, Phelan PD, Story I. A twelve month comparison of standard versus modified chest physiotherapy in twenty infants with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1997;**Suppl 14**:299.

Button BM, Heine RG, Catto-Smith A, Olinsky A, Phelan PD, Story I. Chest physiotherapy for children with CF-birth to two years: issues to consider [abstract]. *The Netherlands Journal of Medicine* 1999;54 (Suppl):S18–S19.

Button BM, Heine RG, Catto-Smith AG, Olinsky A, Phelan PD, Ditchfield M, et al. The five year follow-up of two groups of newly diagnosed infants with CF randomized to receive standard (with tip) of modified (without tip) physiotherapy during infancy [abstract]. Abstracts of the 24th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 2001 June 6-9; Vienna. 2001:111.

* Button BM, Heine RG, Catto-Smith AG, Olinsky A, Phelan PD, Ditchfield MR, et al. Chest physiotherapy in infants with cystic fibrosis: to tip or not? A five-year study. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2003; **35**(3):208–13.

Button BM, Phelan P, Olinsky AD, Catto-Smith AG, Heine RG, Ditchfield M, et al. The five year follow-up of two groups of newly diagnosed infants with CF randomized to receive standard or modified physiotherapy during infancy [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2000;**Suppl 20**:301–2.

Button 1997b

* Button BM, Heine RG, Catto Smith AG, Phelan PD, Olinsky A. Postural drainage and gastro-oesophageal reflux in infants with cystic fibrosis. *Archives of Disease in Childhood* 1997;**76**(2):148–50.

Button BM, Olinsky A, Catto-Smith A, Story I. The effects of standard and modified physiotherapy positions and states of arousal including non-nutritive sucking, crying and sleep on gastroesophageal reflux in young infants with CF [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1999;**Suppl 19**:289.

Button 1998

Button BM, Heine RG, Catto-Smith AG, Phelan PD. Postural drainage in cystic fibrosis: is there a link with gastro-oesophageal reflux?. *Journal of Paediatrics and Child Health* 1998;34(4):330–4.

Castile 1998

Castile R, Tice J, Flucke R, Filbrun D, Varekojis S, McCoy K. Comparison of three sputum clearance methods in in-patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonolgy* 1998;**Suppl** 17:329.

Castle 1994

Castle T, Metcalfe C, Knox A, Nottingham City Hospital HRd-NUK. A comparison between the active cycle of breathing technique (A.C.B.T.) and positive expiratory pressure (PEP) mask plus A.C.B.T. on sputum production and lung volumes in adults with Cystic Fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 19th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1994. 1994:O17.

Cegla 1993

Cegla UH, Retzow A. Physical therapy with VRP1 in chronic obstructive respiratory tract diseases--results of a multicenter comparative study [Physiotherapie mit dem VRP1 bei chronisch obstruktiven Atemwegserkrankungen--Ergebnisse einer multizentrischen Vergleichsstudie]. *Pneumologie* 1993;47(11):636–9.

Cerny 1989

Cerny FJ. Relative effects of bronchial drainage and exercise for inhospital care of patients with cystic fibrosis. *Physical Therapy* 1989; **69**(8):633–9.

Chatham 1998

Chatham K, Nixon LS, Ionescu AA, Garwood R, Premier G, Shale DJ. Increased sputum expectoration in cystic fibrosis patients after repeated resisted mueller manoeuvres [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1998;**Suppl 17**:348.

Chatham K, Nixon LS, Ionescu AA, Shale DJ. Repeated inspiratory manoeuvres against a fixed resistance with biofeedback is more effective than standard chest physiotherapy in aiding sputum expectoration in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1999;**Suppl** 19:289.

Chatham 2004

Chatham K, Ionescu AA, Nixon LS, Shale DJ. A short-term comparison of two methods of sputum expectoration in cystic fibrosis. *European Respiratory Journal* 2004;**23**(3):435–9.

Cochrane 1977

Cochrane GM, Webber BA, Clarke SW. Effects of sputum on pulmonary function. *British Medical Journal* 1977;2:1181–3.

Costantini 1998

Costantini D, Brivio A, Brusa D, Delfino R, Fredella C, Russo M, et al. PEP-mask versus postural drainage in CF infants a long-term comparative trial [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2001;**Suppl 22**: 308.

Costantini D, Brivio A, Brussa D, Delfino R, Fredella C, Russo MC, et al. PEP-mask versus postural drainage in CF infants a long-term comparative trial [abstract]. Abstracts of the 24th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 2001 June 6-9; Vienna. 2001:P100.

Costantini D, Brivio A, Delfino R, Sguera A, Brusa D, Padoan R, Giunta A. PEP mask versus postural drainage in CF infants [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1998;**Suppl 17**:342.

Darbee 1990

Dadparvar S, Darbee J, Jehan A, Bensel K, Slizofski WJ, Holsclaw D. Tc-DIPA aerosol ventilation evaluates the effectiveness of PEP mask in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *European Respiratory Journal* 1995;**8**(Suppl 19):177s.

Darbee J, Dadparvar S, Bensel K, Jehan A, Watkins M, Holsclaw D. Radionuclide assessment of the comparative effects of chest physical therapy and positive expiratory pressure mask in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990;**Suppl 5**:251.

Davidson 1988

Davidson AGF, McIlwaine PM, Wong TK, Nakielna EM, Pirie GE. Physiotherapy in Cystic Fibrosis: A comparative trial of positive expiratory pressure, autogenic drainage and conventional percussion and drainage techniques [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1988;**Suppl 2**: 137.

McIlwaine PM, Davidson AGF. Comparison of positive expiratory pressure and autogenic drainage with conventional percussion and drainage therapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 17th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1991 June 18-21; Copenhagen. 1991:S8.4.

McIlwaine PM, Davidson AGF, Wong LTK, Pirie GE, Nakielna EM. Comparison of positive expiratory pressure and autogenic drainage with conventional percussion and drainage therapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the Tenth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1988 March 5-10; Sydney. 1988:R(d)3.

Davidson 1992

Davidson AGF, Wong LTK, Pirie GE, McIlwaine PM. Long-term comparative trial of conventional percussion and drainage physiotherapy versus autogenic drainage in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the Sixth North American Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1992. 1992:235.

McIlwaine PM, Wong LTK, Pirie GE, Davidson AGF. Long-term comparative trial of conventional percussion and drainage physiotherapy versus autogenic drainage in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 11th International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1992. 1992.

Davidson 1998

Davidson AGF, McIlwaine PM, Wong LTK, Peacock D. "Flutter versus PEP": A long-term comparative trial of positive expiratory pressure (PEP) versus oscillating positive expiratory pressure (Flutter) physiotherapy techniques [abstract]. Proceedings of the 22nd European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1998 June 13-18; Berlin. 1998:71.

* McIlwaine PM, Wong LT, Peacock D, Davidson AGF. Long-term comparative trial of positive expiratory pressure (flutter) physiotherapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis. *Journal of Pediatrics* 2001;**138** (6):845–50.

McIlwaine PM, Wong LTK, Peacock D, Davidson AGF. "Flutter versus PEP": A long-term comparative trial of positive expiratory pressure (PEP) versus oscillating positive expiratory pressure (Flutter) physiotherapy techniques [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1997;**Suppl 14**:299.

de Boeck 1984

de Boeck C, Zinman R. Cough Versus Chest Physiotherapy. A comparison of the acute effects on pulmonary function in patients with cystic fibrosis. *American Review Respiratory Disease* 1984;**129**:182–4.

Delk 1994

Delk KK, Gevirtz R, Hicks DA, Carden F, Rucker R. The effects of biofeedback assisted breathing retraining on lung functions in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1994;**105**(1):23–8.

Desmond 1983

Desmond KJ, Schwenk WF, Thomas E, Beaudry PH, Coates AL. Immediate and long-term effects of chest physiotherapy in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Journal of Pediatrics* 1983;**103**(4):538–42.

Elkins 2000

Elkins MR, Ellis ER, Badr C. The effect of gravity assisted drainage (postural drainage) positions and other body positions on huff and cough strength [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2000;**Suppl 20**:302.

Falk 1984

Falk M, Kelstrup M, Andersen JB, Kinoshita T, Falk P, Stovring S, et al. Improving the ketchup bottle method with positive expiratory pressure, PEP, in cystic fibrosis. *European Journal of Respiratory Disease* 1984;**65**(6):423–32.

Falk 1988

Falk M, Kelstrup M, Andersen JB, Pedersen SS, Rossing I, Dirksen H. PEP treatment or physical exercise. Effects on secretions expectorated and indices of central and peripheral airway function A controlled study [abstract]. Proceedings of the 10th International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1988 March 5-10; Sydney. 1988:P. & E. (o)1.

Fauroux 1999

Fauroux B, Boule M, Lofaso F, Zerah F, Clement A, Harf A, et al. Chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis: improved tolerance with nasal pressure support ventilation. *Pediatrics* 1999;**103**(3):658–9.

Gaskin 1998

Gaskin L, Corey M, Shin J, Reisman JJ, Thomas J, Tullis DE. Long term trial of conventional postural drainage and percussion vs. positive expiratory pressure [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1998;**Suppl** 17:345.

Gayer 1988

Gayer DA, Hagemann V, Murphy K, University of Missouri CMU. Sleep of children with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the Tenth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1988 March 5-10; Sydney. 1988:R(d)8.

Giles 1995

Giles DR, Wagener JS, Accurso FJ, Butler Simon N. Short-term effects of postural drainage with clapping vs autogenic drainage on oxygen saturation and sputum recovery in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1995;**108**(4):952–4.

Giles 1996

Giles D, Sontag M, Wagener J, Accurso F. Effect of One Month of Treatment with Flutter Valve or Postural Drainage and Clapping on Pulmonary Function and Sputum Recovery in Cystic Fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**Suppl 13**:354.

Gondor 1999

* Gondor M, Nixon PA, Mutich R, Rebovich P, Orenstein DM. Comparison of Flutter device and chest physical therapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis pulmonary exacerbation. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1999;**28**(4):255–60.

Gondor M, Nixon PA, Rebovich PJ, Orenstein DM. A Comparison of the Flutter Device and Chest Physical Therapy in the Treatment of Cystic Fibrosis Pulmonary Exacerbation [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**355**:307.

Gotz 1995

Gotz M, Wolkerstorfer A. Physiotherapy in Cystic Fibrosis: Intrapulmonary Percussive Ventilation (IPV) Versus Positive Expiratory Pressure (PEP) [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**Suppl 12**:267.

Grasso 2000

* Grasso MC, Button BM, Allison DJ, Sawyer SM. Benefits of music therapy as an adjunct to chest physiotherapy in infants and toddlers with cystic fibrosis. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2000;**29**(5):371–81.

Grasso MC, Button BM, Sawyer SM, Allison DJ. Music: meeting the challenge of adherence to chest physiotherapy for infants and toddlers with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonolgy* 1998; **Suppl 17**:397.

Hare 2002

Hare KL, Hommick DN, Cucos D, Marks JH. The PercussiveTech HF device compared to standard chest physiotherapy in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonolgy* 2002; **Suppl 24**:316.

Hartsell 1978

Hartsell M, Traver G, Taussig LM. Comparison of manual percussion and vibration (P &V) vs. mechanical vibration (MV) alone on maximal expiratory flows [abstract]. 19th Cystic Fibrosis Club Abstracts. 1978:49.

Hofmeyr 1986

* Hofmeyr JL, Webber BA, Hodson ME. Evaluation of positive expiratory pressure as an adjunct to chest physiotherapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 1986;41(12):951–4.

Webber BA, Hofmeyr JL, Hodson ME, Batten JC. Evaluation of positive expiratory pressure as an adjunct to postural drainage [abstract]. Proceedings of the 13th Annual Meeting of the European Working Group for Cystic Fibrosis; 1985 Nov 3-8; Jerusalem. 1985:95.

Homnick 1995

Homnick D, Spillers C, White F. The intrapulmonary percussive ventilator compared to standard aerosol therapy and chest physiotherapy in the treatment of patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pedaitric Pulmonology* 1994;**Suppl 10**:312.

* Homnick DN, White F, de Castro C. Comparison of effects of an intrapulmonary percussive ventilator to standard aerosol and chest physiotherapy in treatment of cystic fibrosis. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**20**:50–5.

Homnick 1998

* Homnick DN, Anderson K, Marks JH. Comparison of the flutter device to standard chest physiotherapy in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis: a pilot study. *Chest* 1998;**114**(4):993–7.

Homnick DN, Marks JH. Comparison of the Flutter Device to Standard Chest Physiotherapy in Hospitalized Patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**356**(Suppl 13):308.

Jacobs 1981

Jacobs M, Ben-Zvi Z, Kattan M, Bonforte R. The Effect of Chest Physical Therapy on Oxygen Saturation in Cystic Fibrosis Patients [abstract]. 22nd Cystic Fibrosis Club Abstracts. 1981:124.

Keller 2001

Keller H, Liniger W, Fopp A, Hoch M, Knopfli B. Effects of daily harminica play during in-hospital care of patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstracts of the 24th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 2001 June 6-9; Vienna. 2001:339.

Kerrebijn 1982

Kerrebijn KF, Veentjer R, Bonzet v.d. Water E. The immediate effect of physiotherapy and aerosol treatment on pulmonary function in children with cystic fibrosis. *European Journal of Respiratory Disease* 1982;**63**(1):35–42.

Klig 1989

Klig S, Denning C, Jacoby J, Xia F, Gaerlan P, Bisberg D, et al. A biopsychosocial examination of two methods of pulmonary therapy [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1989;**Suppl** 4:128.

Kluft 1996

Kluft J, Beker L, Castagnino M, Gaiser J, Chaney H, Fink RJ. A comparison of bronchial drainage treatments in cystic fibrosis. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**22**(4):271–4.

Kofler 1994

Kofler AM, Belluscio M, Bressan T, Carlesi A, Leone P, Lucidi V, et al. PEP-mask and active cycle of breathing techniques. What is better in children with Cystic Fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 19th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1994. 1994:O66.

Kofler 1998

Kofler AM, Carlesi A, Cutrera R, Leone P, Lucidi V, Rosati S, et al. BiPAP versus PEP as chest physiotherapy in patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1998;**Suppl** 17:344.

Konstan 1994

Konstan MW, Stern RC, Doershuk CF. Efficacy of the Flutter device for airway mucus clearance in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Journal of Pediatrics* 1994;**124**(5 Pt 1):689–93.

Kraig 1995

Kraig R, Kirkpatrick KR, Howard D, Ter-Pogossian M, Kollef MH. A direct comparison of manual chest percussion with acoustic percussion, an experimental treatment for cystic fibrosis. American Thoracic Society 1995 (American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine Supplements) 1995; Vol. 151, issue 4:A738.

Lagerkvist 1997

Lagerkvist AL, Sten G, Lindblad A, Redfors S. Chest physiotherapy with positive expiratory pressure (PEP) and oscillating positive expiratory pressure (flutter) in patients with cystic fibrosis-a comparative study [abstract]. Proceedings of the 21st European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1997; Davos. 1997:132.

Langenderfer 1998

Langenderfer, B. Alternatives to percussion and postural drainage. A review of mucus clearance therapies: percussion and postural drainage, autogenic drainage, positive expiratory pressure, flutter valve, intrapulmonary percussive ventilation, and high-frequency chest compression with the ThAIRapy Vest. *Journal of Cardiopulmonary Rehabilitation* 1998;**18**(4):283–9.

Lannefors 1992

Lannefors L, Wollmer P. Mucus clearance in cystic fibrosis - a comparison between postural drainage, PEP-mask and physical exercise [abstract]. Proceedings of the 11th International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1992. 1992:AHP31.

* Lannefors L, Wollmer P. Mucus clearance with three chest physiotherapy regimes in cystic fibrosis: a comparison between postural drainage, PEP and physical exercise. *European Respiratory Journal* 1992;**5**(6):748–53.

Lindemann 1992

Lindemann H. The value of physical therapy with VRP 1-Desitin ("Flutter") [Zum Stellenwert der Physiotherapie mit dem VRP 1-Desitin ("Flutter")]. *Pneumologie* 1992;**46**(12):626–30.

Lorin 1971

Lorin MI, Denning CR. Evaluation of postural drainage by measurement of sputum volume and consistency. *American Journal of Physical Medicine* 1971;**50**(5):215–9.

Lyons 1992

Lyons E, Chatham K, Campbell IA, Prescott RJ. Evaluation of the flutter VRP1 device in young adults with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 11th International Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1992. 1992.

Majaesic 1996

Majaesic CM, Montgomery M, Jones R, King M. Reduction in Sputum Viscosity using High Frequency Chest Compressions (HFCC) compared to Conventional Chest Physiotherapy (CCP) [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**Suppl 13**:358.

Marks 1999

Marks JH, Hare KL, Homnick D. The PercussiveTech HF device compared to standard chest physiotherapy in patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstract book XIII Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:151.

Marks JH, Hare KL, Homnick DN. Pulmonary function and sputum production in patients with cystic fibrosis: a pilot study comparing the percussivetech HF device and standard chest physiotherapy [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1999;**Suppl 19**:290.

* Marks JH, Hare KL, Saunders RA, Homnick DN. Pulmonary function and sputum production in patients with cystic fibrosis: a pilot study comparing the PercussiveTech HF device and standard chest physiotherapy. *Chest* 2004;125(4):1507–11.

Maxwell 1979

Maxwell M, Redmond A. Comparative trial of manual and mechanical percussion technique with gravity-assisted bronchial drainage in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Archives of Disease in Childhood* 1979;**54** (7):542–4.

McIlwaine 1997

Button B, Herbert R, Maher C. Positive expiratory pressure therapy better maintains pulmonary function than postural drainage and percussion in patients with cystic fibrosis [comment]. *Australian Journal of Physiotherapy* 1998;44(4):285–6.

* McIlwaine PM, Wong LT, Peacock D, Davidson AG. Long-term comparative trial of conventional postural drainage and percussion versus positive expiratory pressure physiotherapy in the treatment

of cystic fibrosis [see comments]. *Journal of Pediatrics* 1997;**131**(4): 570–4

McIlwaine PM, Wong LTK, Peacock D, Davidson AGF. Long-term comparative trial of conventional postural drainage and percussion versus positive expiratory pressure physiotherapy in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 12th International Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1996 June 16-21; Jerusalem. 1996:S193.

McIlwaine PM, Wong LTK, Peacock D, Davidson AGF. Long-Term Comparative Trial of Conventional Postural Drainage and Percussion Versus Positive Expiratory Pressure Physiotherapy in the Treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**Suppl 12**: 268.

Miller 1995

Hall DO, Miller S, Clayton CB, Nelson R. Chest physiotherapy in Cystic Fibrosis: A comparative study of autogenic drainage and the active cycle of breathing technique [abstract]. Proceedings of the 19th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1994. 1994:O64.

* Miller S, Hall DO, Clayton CB, Nelson R. Chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis: A comparative study of autogenic drainage and the active cycle of breathing techniques with postural drainage. *Thorax* 1995;**50**(2):165–9.

Miller S, Hall DO, Clayton CB, Nelson R. Chest physiotherapy in Cystic Fibrosis (CF) a comparative study of autogenic drainage (AD) and active cycle of breathing technique (ACBT) (formerly FET) [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1993;**Suppl** 9:240.

Morris 1982

Morris D, Barbero G, Konig P, Woodruff C, Kline J, Martinez R. The effect of mechanical and manual percussion on pulmonary function in cystic fibrosis patients [abstract]. 23rd Cystic Fibrosis Club Abstracts; 1982 May 14; Washington D.C. 1982:135.

Mulholland 1994

Mulholland C, Lennon S, Graham R. Does prone positioning improve oxygen saturation in a patient with cystic fibrosis? An alternating-treatment single case design. *Physiotherapy Theory and Practice* 1994;**10**:223–33.

Murphy 1983

Murphy MB, Concannon D, Fitzgerald MX. Chest percussion: Help or Hindrance to Postural Drainage?. *Irish Medical Journal* 1983;**76** (4):189–91.

Murphy 1988

Murphy K, Hagemann V, Morris-Gayer D. Effects of chest physiotherapy on sleep onset in hospitalized cystic fibrosis patients [abstract]. Proceedings of the 10th International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1988 March 4-10; Sydney. 1988:R(d)7.

Natale 1994

Natale JE, Pfeifle J, Homnick DN. Comparison of intrapulmonary percussive ventilation and chest physiotherapy. A pilot study in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1994;**105**(6):1789–93.

Newhouse 1998

Newhouse P, White F, Marks J, Homnick D. Pulmonary function testing and sputum production in patients with cystic fibrosis: A pilot study comparing the flutter device, intrapulmonary percussion ventilator and standard chest physiotherapy [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**Suppl 12**:269.

* Newhouse PA, White F, Marks JH, Homnick DN. The intrapulmonary percussive ventilator and flutter device compared to standard chest physiotherapy in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Clinical Pediatrics* 1998;37(7):427–32.

Oberwaldner 1986

Oberwaldner B, Evans JC, Zach MS. Forced expirations against a variable resistance: a new chest physiotherapy method in cystic fibrosis. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1986;**2**(6):358–67.

Oberwaldner 1991

Oberwaldner B, Theißl B, Rucker A, Zach MS. Chest physiotherapy in hospitalized patients with cystic fibrosis: a study of lung function effects and sputum production. *European Respiratory Journal* 1991;4 (2):152–8.

Orlik 2000

Orlik T. Evaluation of the efficiency of selected thoracic physiotherapy methods used in the treatment of patients with cystic fibrosis [Ocena metod autodren azu w wybranej grupie chorych na mukowiscydoze z uwzglednieniem czynnika strodowiskowego]. *Medycyna Wieku Rozwojowego* 2000;4(3):233–46.

Orlik 2001

* Orlik T, Sands D. Long-term evaluation of effectiveness for selected chest physiotherapy methods used in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [Dlugofalowa ocean skuteczności wybranych metod fizjoterapii klatki piersiowej stosowanych w leczeniu church na mukowiscydoze]. *Medycyna Wieku Rozwojowego* 2001;**5**(3):245–57.

Orlik T, Sands D. Long-term study of efficiencies of selects physiotherapy methods used in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstracts of the 24th European Cystsic Fibrosis Conference; 2001 June 6-9; Vienna. 2001:113.

Padman 1999

Padman R, Geouque DM, Engelhardt MT. Effects of the flutter device on pulmonary function studies among pediatric cystic fibrosis patients. *Delaware Medical Journal* 1999;71(1):13–18.

Parker 1984

Parker RA, Webber BA, Sutton PP, Newman SP, Garland N, Lopez-Vidriero MT, et al. Evaluation of three individual components of a postural drainage treatment [abstract]. Proceedings of the Ninth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1984. 1984;2.13.

Parsons 1995

Parsons DW, Williams MT, Frick RA, Ellis ER, Martin AJ, Giles SE, et al. Chest Physiotherapy: Improvements in Lung Function and Ventilation are associated with Physiotherapy-Assisted Treatment [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1995;**Suppl 12**:271.

Williams M, Parsons D, Martin A, Giles S, Staugas REM. Energy expenditure during chest physiotherapy in normal and cystic fibrosis (CF) subjects [abstract]. *Australia and New Zealand Journal of Medicine* 1994;**24**:445.

Phillips 1998a

Phillips GE, Pike SE, Rosenthal M, Bush A. Holding the baby: head downwards positioning for physiotherapy does not cause gastro-oe-sophageal reflux. *European Respiratory Journal* 1998;**12**(4):954–7.

Phillips 1998b

Phillips GE, Pike S, Jaffe A, Bush A. Comparison of the active cycle of breathing techniques and external high frequency oscillation jacket for clearance of secretions in children with cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 1998;**53**(Suppl 4):A61.

Pike 1999

Pike SE, Machin AC, Dix KJ, Pryor JA, Hodson ME. Comparison of flutter VRPI and forced expirations (FE) with active cycle of breathing techniques (ACBT) in subjects with cystic fibrosis (CF). *The Netherlands Journal of Medicine* 1999;**54**(Suppl. (Proceedings and Abstracts of the ECFS 23rd European Cystic Fibrosis Conference, The Hague, The Netherlands, 9 - 12 June, 1999)):S55–S56.

Pollard 2000

Pollard K, Peckham D, Crafton K, McMunn E, Mee C. The effect of increased gravitational and centrifugal forces on sputum expectoration in adults with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstract book XIIIth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:152.

Pryor 1979a

Hodson ME, Batten JC, Pryor JA, Webber BA, Brompton Hospital L. Evaluation of the forced expiration technique as an adjunct to postural drainage in the treatment of cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the Ninth European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1979 June 12-13; Noordwijkerhout. 1979:57.

* Pryor JA, Webber BA, Hodson ME, Batten JC. Evaluation of the forced expiration technique as an adjunct to postural drainage in treatment of cystic fibrosis. *British Medical Journal* 1979;**2**(6187): 417–8.

Pryor 1979b

Pryor JA, Webber BA. An evaluation of the forced expiration technique as an adjunct to postural drainage. *Physiotherapy* 1979;**65**(10): 304–7.

Pryor 1981

Pryor JA, Parker RA, Webber BA. A comparison of mechanical and manual percussion as adjuncts to postural drainage in the treatment of cystic fibrosis in adolescents and adults. *Physiotherapy* 1981;**67**(5): 140–1.

Pryor 1990

Pryor JA, Webber BA, Hodson ME. Effect of chest physiotherapy on oxygen saturation in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 1990;**45** (1):77.

Pryor 1994

* Pryor JA, Webber BA, Hodson ME, Warner JO. The Flutter VRP1 as an adjunct to chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis. *Respiratory Medicine* 1994;88(9):677–81.

Pryor JA, Webber BA, Hodson ME, Warner JO. The Flutter VRP1 as an adjunct to chest physiotherapy in Cystic Fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 11th International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1992. 1992:WP 102.

Reisman 1988

Reisman JJ, Rivington Law B, Corey M, Marcotte J, Wannamaker E, Harcourt D, et al. Role of conventional physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis [see comments]. *Journal of Pediatrics* 1988;**113**(4):632–6.

Roos 1987

Roos S, Birrer P, Rüdeberg A, Kraemer R. First experience with intrapulmonary percussive ventilation (IPV) in the treatment of patients with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 15th Annual

Meeting of the European Working Group for Cystic Fibrosis; 1987.

Salh 1989

Salh W, Bilton D, Dodd M, Webb AK. Effect of exercise and physiotherapy in aiding sputum expectoration in adults with cystic fibrosis. *Thorax* 1989;44(12):1006–8.

Samuelson 1994

Samuelson W, Woodward V, Lowe V. Utility of a Dynamic air therapy bed vs. conventional chest physiotherapy in adult CF patients [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1994;**Suppl 10**:313.

Sanchez 1999

Sanchez Riera H, Dapena Fernandez FJ, Gomez Dominguez F, Ortega Ruiz F, Elias Hernandez T, Montemayor Rubio T, et al. Comparative study of the efficacy of 2 respiratory physiotherapy protocols for patients with cystic fibrosis [Estudio comparativo de la eficacia de dos protocolos de fisioterapia respiratoria en pacientes con fibrosis quistica]. *Archivos de bronconeumologia* 1999;35(6):275–9.

Scherer 1998

Scherer TA, Barandun J, Martinez E, Wanner A, Rubin EM. Effect of high-frequency oral airway and chest wall oscillation and conventional chest physical therapy on expectoration in patients with stable cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 1998;113(4):1019–27.

Steen 1991

* Steen HJ, Redmond AO, O'Neill D, Beattie F. Evaluation of the PEP mask in cystic fibrosis. *Acta Paediatrica Scandinavia* 1991;**80** (1):51–6.

Steen HJ, Redmond AOB, O' Neill D, Beattie F. Has the PEP mask a role in the management of teenage patients? [abstract]. Proceedings of the 13th Annual Meeting of the European Working Group for Cystic Fibrosis; 1985 Nov 3-8; Jeusalem. 1985:94.

Steven 1992

Steven MH, Pryor JA, Webber BA, Hodson MR. Physiotherapy versus cough alone in the treatment of cystic fibrosis. *New Zealand Journal of Physiotherapy* August 1992:31–7.

Stiller 1996

Stiller K. Are thoracic expansion exercises necessary during the active cycle of breathing techniques for adult cystic fibrosis patients? [abstract]. Proceedings of the 12th International Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1996. 1996:S275.

Stites 2006

Stites SW, Perry GV, Peddicord T, Cox G, McMillan C, Becker B. Effect of high-frequency chest wall oscillation on the central and peripheral distribution of aerosolized diethylene triamine penta-acetic acid as compared to standard chest physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis. *Chest* 2006;**129**(3):712–7.

Sutton 1985

Sutton PP, Lopez-Vidriero MT, Pavia D, Newman SP, Clay MM, Webber B, et al. Assessment of percussion, vibratory shaking and breathing exercises in chest physiotherapy. *European Journal of Respiratory Disease* 1985;**66**(2):147–52.

Tannenbaum 2001

Tannenbaum E, Prasad SA, Main E, Stocks J. The effect of chest physiotherapy on cystic fibrosis patients undergoing general anaesthesia

for an elective surgical procedure [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 2001;**Suppl 22**:315.

Tecklin 1976

Holsclaw DS, Tecklin JS. The effectiveness of bronchial drainage and aerosol inhalation in cystic fibrosis. *Cystic Fibrosis* 1977:230–8.

Tecklin JS, Holsclaw DS Jr. Bronchial drainage with aerosol medications in cystic fibrosis. *Physical Therapy* 1976;**56**(9):999–1003.

Thomas 1995

Thomas J, DeHueck A, Kleiner M, Newton J, Crowe J, Mahler S. To vibrate or not to vibrate: usefulness of the mechanical vibrator for clearing bronchial secretions. *Physiotherapy Canada* 1995;47:120–5.

Tonnesen 1982

Tonnesen P, Kelstrup M. Self-administered positive end expiratory pressure (PEEP) using a face mask as an alternative to conventional lung [Selvadministeret positivt sluteksspiratorisk tryk (PEEP) pa maske som alternativ til konventionel lungefysioterapi]. *Ugeskrift for Laeger* 1982;144(21):1532–6.

Tugay 2000

Tugay U, Inal Ince D, Savci S, Arikan H, Tunali N, Demirel H, Ozcelik U, Kiper N, Gocmen A. Effects of Flutter valve therapy on pulmonary functions and oxygen saturation in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstracts XIIIth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:151.

Tyrrell 1985

Tyrrell JC, Martin J, Hiller EJ. 'PEP' mask physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 13th Annual Meeting of the European Working Group for Cystic Fibrosis; 1985 Nov 3-8; Jerusalem. 1985:23.

Tyrrell 1986

Tyrrell JC, Hiller EJ, Martin J. Face mask physiotherapy in cystic fibrosis. *Archives of Disease in Childhood* 1986;**61**(6):598–600.

van Asperen 1987

van Asperen PP, Jackson L, Hennessy P, Brown J. Comparison of a positive expiratory pressure (PEP) mask with postural drainage in patients with cystic fibrosis. *Australian Paediatric Journal* 1987;**23**(5): 283–4.

van Hengstum 1987

Van Hengstum M, Festen J, Beurskens C, Hankel M, Van den Broek W, Buijs W, et al. The effect of positive expiratory pressure (PEP) versus forced expiration technique (FET) on tracheobronchial clearance in chronic bronchitics [abstract]. Proceedings of the 15th Annual Meeting of the European Working Group for Cystic Fibrosis; 1987. 1987.

van Hengstum 1988

van Hengstum M, Festen J, Beurskens C, Hankel M, Beekman F, Corstens F. Conventional physiotherapy and forced expiration manoeuvres have similar effects on tracheobronchial clearance. *European Respiratory Journal* 1988;1(8):758–61.

van Winden 1998

* van Winden CM, VisserA, Hop W, Sterk PJ, Beckers S, de-Jongste JC. Effects of flutter and PEP mask physiotherapy on symptoms and lung function in children with cystic fibrosis. *European Respiratory Journal* 1998;**12**(1):143–7.

van Winden CMQ, Visser A, Hop W, Sterk PJ, Beckers S, de Jongste JC. Effects of Flutter and PEP-MASK on expectoratin and lung function in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the 12th International Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1996. 1996:S275.

VanGinderdeuren 2000

van Ginderdeuren F, Malfroot A, Opdeweegh L, Dab I. Intrapulmonary percussive ventilation (IPV) in cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstract XIIIth international cystic fibrosis congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:152.

Verboon 1986

* Verboon JM, Bakker W, Sterk PJ. The value of the forced expiration technique with and without postural drainage in adults with cystic fibrosis. *European Journal of Respiratory Diseases* 1986;**69**(3):169–74.

Verboon JML, Bakker W, Dijkman JH. Effect of the forced expiration technique and postural drainage in adults with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Proceedings of the Ninth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1984. 1984:2.17.

Verboon JML, Bakker W, Sterk PJ. De waarde van de 'forced expiration technique' (FET). Ned. T. Fysiotherapie 1987;97:62–4.

Warwick 1990

Warwick WJ, Wielnski CI. Matched pair comparison of manual chest physical therapy (CPT) and the thairapy bronchial drainage vest (ThBVD) system [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990;**Suppl** 5:177.

Warwick 1991

Warwick WJ, Hansen LG. The long-term effect of high-frequency chest compression therapy on pulmonary complications of cystic fibrosis. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1991;**11**(3):265–71.

Warwick 2004

Warwick WJ, Wielinski CL, Hansen LG. Comparison of expectorated sputum after manual chest physical therapy and high-frequency chest compression. *Biomedical Instrumentation Technology* 2004;**38** (6):470–5.

Webber 1985

* Webber BA, Parker R, Hofmeyr J, Hodson M. Evaluation of self-percussion during postural drainage using the forced expiration technique. *Physiotherapy Practice* 1985;1:42–5.

Webber BA, Parker RA, Hofmeyr JL, Hodson ME. Evaluation of self-percussion during postural drainage using the forced expiration technique (FET) [abstract]. Proceedings of the Ninth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 1984. 1984:2.12.

White 1997

White D, Stiller K, Willson K. The role of thoracic expansion exercises during the active cycle of breathing techniques. *Physiotherapy Theory and Practice* 1997;**13**:155–62.

Wilson 1995

Wilson GE, Baldwin AL, Walshaw MJ. Chest physiotherapy in patients with Cystic Fibrosis (CF) - a comparison of traditional methods with the active cycle of breathing [abstract]. Proceedings of the 20th European Cystic Fibrosis Conference; 1995 June; Brussels. 1995: P58

Wong 1999

Wong LT, McIlwaine PM, Davidson AG, Lillquist YP. Gastroesophageal reflux during chest physiotherapy: a comparison of positive expiratory pressure and postural drainage with percussion [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1999;**Suppl 19**:288.

Wong LTK, McIllwaine PM, Davidson AGF. Gastroesphageal reflux during chest physiotherapy: a comparison of positive expiratory pressure and postural drainage with percussion [abstract]. Abstract book XIIIth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:130.

Wordsworth 1996

Wordsworth AE, McDonald A, Lacy D, Smyth R. Bronchial Lavage in Cystic Fibrosis Patients during General Anaesthesia for Elective Surgery [abstract]. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1996;**Suppl 13**:362.

Zapletal 1983

Zapletal A, Stefanova J, Horak J, Vavrova V, Samanek M. Chest physiotherapy and airway obstruction in patients with cystic fibrosis - a negative report. *European Journal of Respiratory Disease* 1983;**64** (6):426–33.

Znotina 2000

Znotina I, Svabe V. The effectiveness of physiotherapy for children with cystic fibrosis [abstract]. Abstract book XIIIth International Cystic Fibrosis Congress; 2000 June 4-8; Stockholm. 2000:152.

Additional references

Cantin 1995

Cantin A. Cystic fibrosis lung inflammation: Early, sustained, and severe. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine* 1995;**151**:939–41.

Elbourne 2002

Elbourne DR, Altman DG, Higgins JPT, Curtin F, Worthington HV, Vail A. Meta-analyses involving cross-over trials: methodological issues. *International Journal of Epidemiology* 2002;**31**(1):140–9.

Jadad 1996

Jadad AR, Moore A, Carroll D, Jenkinson C, Reynolds DJM, Gavaghan DJ, et al. Assessing the quality of reports of randomized clinical trials: Is blinding necessary?. *Controlled Clinical Trials* 1996;17 (1):1–12.

Jones 1998

Jones AP, Rowe BH. Bronchopulmonary hygiene physical therapy for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and bronchiectasis. In: *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, 4, 1998.

Konstan 1997

Konstan MW, Berger M. Current understanding of the inflammatory process in cystic fibrosis: onset and etiology. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1997;**24**:137–42.

Prasad 1998

Prasad A, Main E. Finding evidence to support airway clearance techniques in cystic fibrosis. *Disability and Rehabilitation* 1998;**20**: 235–46.

Review Manager 2004

The Cochrane Collaboration. Review Manager (RevMan) [Computer program]. 4.2.6 for Windows. Oxford, England: The Cochrane Collaboration, 2004.

Thomas 1995a

Thomas J, Cook DJ, Brooks D. Chest physical therapy management of patients with cystic fibrosis. A meta-analysis. *American Journal of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine* 1995;**151**:846–50.

van der Schans 1996

Schans CP van der, Mark Th W van der, Rubin BK, Postma DS, Koeter GH. Chest physical therapy: mucus mobilizing techniques. In: BachJR editor(s). *Pulmonary Rehabilitation*. Philadelphia, USA: Hanley & Belfus, 1996:229–46.

Zach 1990

Zach MS. Lung disease in cystic fibrosis - an updated concept. *Pediatric Pulmonology* 1990;**8**:188–202.

TABLES

Characteristics of included studies

Study	Braggion 1995
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis n = 16 mean (sd) age 20.3 (4) years
Interventions	 high-frequency chest compression postural drainage, breathing exercises, vibrations, manual percussion PEP breathing control
Outcomes	- wet and dry weight expectorated mucus - FVC, FEV1, FEF25-75% - subjective assessment
Notes	Measurement 30 minutes after intervention
Allocation concealment	A – Adequate
Study	Falk 1993
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis n = 12
Interventions	- FET, postural drainage - FET, PEP breathing - control
Outcomes	- radioactive tracer clearance
Notes	Measurements 30 minutes, 1 hour, 2 hours and 24 hours after intervention
Allocation concealment	B – Unclear
Study	Mortensen 1991
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis n = 10 mean (sd) age 20 (3.4) years

^{*}Indicates the major publication for the study

Characteristics of included studies (Continued)

Interventions	- postural drainage, FET, thoracic expansion exercises, relaxation - PEP breathing, FET
0	- control, spontaneous coughing
Outcomes	- radioactive tracer clearance
Notes	Measurements 30 minutes, 1 hour and 24 hours after intervention
Allocation concealment	B – Unclear
Study	Pfleger 1992
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis
	n = 14 mean (range) age 14 (9.8 - 22.4) years
Interventions	- PEP breathing - AD - PEP followed by AD - AD followed by PEP
	- control, spontaneous coughing
Outcomes	- FVC, FEV1, RV/TLC, Raw
	- weight expectorated mucus
Notes	Measurements during an immediately after intervention
Allocation concealment	B – Unclear
Study	Rossman 1982
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis $n = 6$
	mean (sd) age: 22.8 (5.6) years
Interventions	 postural drainage postural drainage, mechanical percussion regimented coughing chest physiotherapy, breathing exercises, vibrations, manual percussion, postural drainage control, spontaneous coughing
Outcomes	- radioactive tracer clearance
Notes	Measurements during and up to 2 hours after intervention
Allocation concealment	B – Unclear
Study	van der Schans 1991
Methods	Cross-over trial with random order of the interventions
Participants	Cystic fibrosis n = 8
	mean (sd) age: 16 (3) years
Interventions	 PEP breathing with a resistance of 5 cmH2O followed by 5 minutes of coughing PEP breathing with a resistance of 15 cmH2O followed by 5 minutes of coughing control followed by 5 minutes of coughing
Outcomes	- radioactive tracer clearance - TLC, FRC

Notes Measurements during intervention

Allocation concealment B – Unclear

AD: autogenic drainage;

FEF25-75%: forced expiratory flow 25-75%

FET: forced expiration technique

FEV1: forced expiratory volume at one second

FRC: functional residual capacity

FVC: forced vital capacity

PEP: positive expiratory pressure breathing

RV: residual volume TLC: total lung capacity

Characteristics of excluded studies

Study	Reason for exclusion
App 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Arens 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Bain 1988	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Baldwin 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Baran 1977	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Battistini 2001	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Bauer 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Bilton 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Blomquist 1986	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Braggion 1996	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Button 1997a	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Button 1997b	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Button 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Castile 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Castle 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Cegla 1993	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Cerny 1989	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Chatham 1998	No physiotherapy to improve mucus clearance
Chatham 2004	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Cochrane 1977	Mixed group of participants (cystic fibrosis, chronic bronchitis, and bronchiectasis)
Costantini 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Darbee 1990	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Davidson 1988	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Davidson 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Davidson 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Delk 1994	No physiotherapy to improve mucus clearance
Desmond 1983	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Elkins 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy

Falk 1984	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Falk 1988	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Fauroux 1999	No chest physiotherapy (airway clearance technique) studied
Gaskin 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Gayer 1988	No chest physiotherapy (airway clearance technique) studied
Giles 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Giles 1996	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Gondor 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Gotz 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Grasso 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Hare 2002	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Hartsell 1978	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Hofmeyr 1986	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Homnick 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Homnick 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Jacobs 1981	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Keller 2001	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Kerrebijn 1982	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Klig 1989	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Kluft 1996	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Kofler 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Kofler 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Konstan 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Kraig 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Lagerkvist 1997	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Langenderfer 1998	Not a clinical trial
Lannefors 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Lindemann 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Lorin 1971	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Lyons 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Majaesic 1996	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Marks 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Maxwell 1979	No control group without chest physiotherapy
McIlwaine 1997	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Miller 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Morris 1982	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Mulholland 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Murphy 1983	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Murphy 1988	No outcome measures that were the primary purpose of this review were used
Natale 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy

Newhouse 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Oberwaldner 1986	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Oberwaldner 1991	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Orlik 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Orlik 2001	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Padman 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Parker 1984	Mixed group of participants: four with cystic fibrosis, five with bronchiectasis, one with asthma
Parsons 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Phillips 1998a	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Phillips 1998b	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pike 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pollard 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pryor 1979a	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pryor 1979b	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pryor 1981	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pryor 1990	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Pryor 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Reisman 1988	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Roos 1987	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Salh 1989	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Samuelson 1994	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Sanchez 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Scherer 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Steen 1991	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Steven 1992	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Stiller 1996	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Stites 2006	Intervention not thought to improve mucus clearance
Sutton 1985	Mixed group of participants: five with bronchiectasis, two with chronic bronchitis and only one with cystic fibrosis
Tannenbaum 2001	Study in participants during intra-operative period under anaesthesia and mechanical ventilation
Tecklin 1976	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Thomas 1995	Not a clinical trial, a review
Tonnesen 1982	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Tugay 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Tyrrell 1985	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Tyrrell 1986	No control group without chest physiotherapy
VanGinderdeuren 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Verboon 1986	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Warwick 1990	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Warwick 1991	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Warwick 2004	No control group without chest physiotherapy

Characteristics of excluded studies (Continued)

Webber 1985	No control group without chest physiotherapy
White 1997	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Wilson 1995	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Wong 1999	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Wordsworth 1996	No chest physiotherapy
Zapletal 1983	No control group without chest physiotherapy
Znotina 2000	No control group without chest physiotherapy
de Boeck 1984	No control group without chest physiotherapy
van Asperen 1987	No control group without chest physiotherapy
van Hengstum 1987	No cystic fibrosis participants
van Hengstum 1988	No control group without chest physiotherapy
van Winden 1998	No control group without chest physiotherapy

GRAPHS AND OTHER TABLES

This review has no analyses.

INDEX TERMS

Medical Subject Headings (MeSH)

Cystic Fibrosis [*therapy]; *Physical Therapy Modalities

MeSH check words

Humans

COVER SHEET

Title Chest physiotherapy compared to no chest physiotherapy for cystic fibrosis

Authors van der Schans C, Prasad A, Main E

Contribution of author(s) Ammani Prasad and Eleanor Main independently assessed studies for inclusion in this review

and assisted in writing of text.

Cess van der Schans acts as guarantor of the review.

Issue protocol first published 1999/1
Review first published 2000/2

Date of most recent amendment 15 November 2006

Date of most recent 09 February 2000

SUBSTANTIVE amendment

What's New Review update: November 2006

The search of the Group's Cystic Fibrosis Trials Register identified two new references. Both

studies were excluded (Stites 2006; Warwick 2004).

Date new studies sought but

none found

Information not supplied by author

Date new studies found but not

yet included/excluded

Information not supplied by author

Date new studies found and

included/excluded

06 September 2006

Date authors' conclusions

section amended

Information not supplied by author

Contact address Dr Cees van der Schans

Professor in Health Care and in Nursing

Hanze University Groningen

P.O. Box 3109 GRONINGEN 9701 DC

NETHERLANDS

E-mail: c.p.van.der.schans@pl.hanze.nl

Tel: +31 50 5953659 Fax: +31 50 5953685

DOI 10.1002/14651858.CD001401

Cochrane Library number CD001401

Editorial group Cochrane Cystic Fibrosis and Genetic Disorders Group

Editorial group code HM-CF